

# MONAD FACT #3

how placing **kleisli composition** logic in **flatMap** permits  
composition of **kleisli arrows** using **for comprehensions**  
and what that logic looks like in six different **monads**

$$\begin{array}{ccc} T^3 & \xrightarrow{T\mu} & T^2 \\ \downarrow \mu T & \text{FACT #3} & \downarrow \mu \\ T^2 & \xrightarrow{\mu} & T \end{array}$$

slides by



[@philip\\_schwarz](https://twitter.com/@philip_schwarz)



[slideshare](https://www.slideshare.net/pjschwarz) <https://www.slideshare.net/pjschwarz>

Consider three functions **f**, **g** and **h** of the following types:

```
f: A => B  
g: B => C  
h: C => D
```

e.g.

```
val f: Int => String = _.toString  
val g: String => Array[Char] = _.toArray  
val h: Array[Char] => String = _.mkString(",")
```

We can compose these functions ourselves:

```
assert( h(g(f(12345))) == "1,2,3,4,5" )
```

Or we can compose them into a single function using **compose**, the **higher-order** function for composing ordinary functions :

```
val hgf = h compose g compose f
```

```
assert( hgf(12345) == "1,2,3,4,5" )
```

Alternatively, we can compose them using **andThen**:

```
val hgf = f andThen g andThen h
```

```
assert( hgf(12345) == "1,2,3,4,5" )
```



 @philip\_schwarz



We have just seen how to compose ordinary functions. What about **Kleisli arrows**: how can they be composed?

As we saw in **MONAD FACT #2**, **Kleisli arrows** are functions of types like  $A \Rightarrow F[B]$ , where  $F$  is a **monadic type constructor**.

Consider three **Kleisli arrows**  $f$ ,  $g$  and  $h$ :

$$\begin{aligned} f &: A \Rightarrow F[B] \\ g &: B \Rightarrow F[C] \\ h &: C \Rightarrow F[D] \end{aligned}$$

How can we compose  $f$ ,  $g$  and  $h$ ?

We can do so using **Kleisli composition**. Here is how we compose the three functions using the **fish operator**, which is the infix operator for **Kleisli Composition**:

$$f \rightsquigarrow g \rightsquigarrow h$$

And here is the signature of the **fish operator**:

$$(A \Rightarrow F[B]) \rightsquigarrow (B \Rightarrow F[C]) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow F[C])$$

So the **fish operator** is where the logic for composing **Kleisli arrows** lives.



 @philip\_schwarz

e.g. here is the **fish operator** for the **Option** monad:

```
// Kleisli composition for Option
implicit class OptionFunctionOps[A, B](f: A => Option[B] ) {
  def ≫ [C](g: B => Option[C]): A => Option[C] =
    a => f(a) match {
      case Some(b) => g(b)
      case None      => None
    }
}
```

and here is the **fish operator** for the **List** monad:

```
// Kleisli composition for List
implicit class ListFunctionOps[A, B](f: A => List[B] ) {
  def ≫ [C](g: B => List[C]): A => List[C] =
    a => f(a).foldRight(List[C]())((b, cs) => g(b) ++ cs)
}
```



But **Kleisli Composition** can also be defined in terms of **flatMap**

$$f \Rightarrow g \equiv \lambda a. f(a) \times g$$



where **flatMap** is the green infix operator whose signature is shown below, together with the signatures of other operators that we'll be using shortly.

$\Rightarrow$	Kleisli composition – $((A \Rightarrow F[B]) \Rightarrow (B \Rightarrow F[C])) \Rightarrow (A \Rightarrow F[C])$ - aka the fish operator
$\times$	$F[A] \times (A \Rightarrow F[B]) \Rightarrow F[B]$ - aka the bind operator
$\mapsto$	$F[A] \mapsto (A \Rightarrow B) \Rightarrow F[B]$ - lifts a function into a monadic context
unit	$A \Rightarrow F[A]$ - lifts a pure value into a monadic context



Let's establish some equivalences

$((f \Rightarrow g) \Rightarrow h)(a)$	$\equiv (f \Rightarrow (g \Rightarrow h))(a)$	// by associativity of $\Rightarrow$
$((\lambda a. f(a)) \times g) \Rightarrow h)(a)$	$\equiv " " " "$	// LHS: rewrite 1st $\Rightarrow$ using $\times$
$(\lambda a. ((\lambda a. f(a)) \times g)(a)) \times h)(a)$	$\equiv " " " "$	// LHS: rewrite 2nd $\Rightarrow$ using $\times$
$(\lambda a. (f(a)) \times g) \times h)(a)$	$\equiv " " " "$	// LHS: simplify
" " " "	$\equiv (\lambda a. f(a)) \times (g \Rightarrow h))(a)$	// RHS: rewrite 1st $\Rightarrow$ using $\times$
" " " "	$\equiv (\lambda a. f(a)) \times (\lambda b. g(b)) \times h)(a)$	// RHS: rewrite 2nd $\Rightarrow$ using $\times$
$(f(a)) \times g) \times h$	$\equiv f(a) \times (\lambda b. g(b)) \times h$	// LHS and RHS: apply function to a
" " " "	$\equiv f(a) \times (\lambda b. g(b)) \times (\lambda c. h(c)) \times \lambda d. unit(d))$	// RHS: rewrite h using $\times$ & unit
" " " "	$\equiv f(a) \times (\lambda b. g(b)) \times (\lambda c. h(c)) \Rightarrow \lambda d. d)$	// RHS: rewrite $\times$ using $\Rightarrow$



If we take the left hand side of the first equivalence and the right hand side of the last equivalence, then we have the following

$$((f \Rightarrow g) \Rightarrow h)(a) \equiv f(a) \times (\lambda b. g(b)) \times (\lambda c. h(c) \Rightarrow \lambda d. d))$$



In **Scala**, the right hand side of the above equivalence is written as follows

```
f(a) flatMap { b =>
  g(b) flatMap { c =>
    h(c) map { d =>
      d
    }
  }
}
```



which can be **sweetened** as follows using the **syntactic sugar** of **for comprehensions** (see **MONAD FACT #1**)

```
for {
  b ← f(a)
  c ← g(b)
  d ← h(c)
} yield d
```



 @philip\_schwarz

So in **Scala**, if instead of putting the logic for composing **Kleisli arrows** in the **fish operator**, we put it in a **flatMap** function, and also provide a **map** function, then we can express the composition of **Kleisli arrows** using a **for comprehension**.

$$((f \Rightarrow g) \Rightarrow h)(a) \equiv \begin{aligned} &\text{for } \\ &b \leftarrow f(a) \\ &c \leftarrow g(b) \\ &d \leftarrow h(c) \\ &\} \text{ yield } d \end{aligned}$$

Next, we'll be looking at the following:

- how six different **monads** are implemented in **Scala** by putting the logic for composing **Kleisli arrows** in **flatMap**.
- examples of using **for comprehensions** to compose **Kleisli arrows** yielding instances of those **monads**.



In the **Scala** code that follows, when we define a **monad**, we'll be defining **map** in terms of **flatMap** in order to stress the fact that it is the **flatMap** function that implements the logic for composing **Kleisli arrows**.

While the examples that we'll be looking at are quite contrived, I believe they do a reasonable enough job of illustrating the notion of composing **Kleisli arrows** using **for comprehensions**.



Let's start with the simplest **monad**, i.e. the **Identity monad**, which does nothing!

```
// the Identity Monad – does absolutely nothing
case class Id[A](a: A) {
    def map[B](f: A => B): Id[B] =
        this flatMap { a => Id(f(a)) }
    def flatMap[B](f: A => Id[B]): Id[B] =
        f(a)
}
```

```
// composing the Kleisli arrows using a for comprehension
val result: Id[Int] =
    for {
        four      <- increment(3)
        eight     <- double(four)
        sixtyFour <- square(eight)
    } yield sixtyFour

assert( result == Id(64) )
```

```
// sample Kleisli arrows
val increment: Int => Id[Int] =
    n => Id(n + 1)

val double: Int => Id[Int] =
    n => Id(n * 2)

val square: Int => Id[Int] =
    n => Id(n * n)

assert( increment(3) == Id(4) )
assert( double(4)    == Id(8) )
assert( square(8)   == Id(64) )
```

```
// the Option Monad
sealed trait Option[+A] {

  def map[B](f: A => B): Option[B] =
    this flatMap { a => Some(f(a)) }

  def flatMap[B](f: A => Option[B]): Option[B] =
    this match {
      case None => None
      case Some(a) => f(a)
    }
}

case object None extends Option[Nothing]
case class Some[+A](get: A) extends Option[A]
```

```
// composing the Kleisli arrows using a for comprehension
val result: Option[String] =
  for {
    char  <- maybeFirstChar("abc")
    letter <- maybeCapitalLetter(char)
    number <- maybeOddNumber(letter)
  } yield s"$char-$letter-$number"

assert( result == Some("a-A-65") )
```



@philip\_schwarz

On the left, we see the **Option monad**, and in the next slide, we look at the **List monad**

```
// sample Kleisli arrows
val maybeFirstChar: String => Option[Char] =
  s => if (s.length > 0) Some(s(0))
        else None

val maybeCapitalLetter: Char => Option[Char] =
  c => if (c >= 'a' && c <= 'z') Some(c.toUpperCase)
        else None

val maybeOddNumber: Char => Option[Int] =
  n => if (n % 2 == 1) Some(n)
        else None

assert( maybeFirstChar("abc") == Some('a') )
assert( maybeFirstChar("") == None )
assert( maybeCapitalLetter('a') == Some('A') )
assert( maybeCapitalLetter('A') == None )
assert( maybeOddNumber('A') == Some(65) )
assert( maybeOddNumber('B') == None )
```

```

// The List Monad
sealed trait List[+A] {

  def map[B](f: A => B): List[B] =
    this flatMap { a => Cons(f(a), Nil) }

  def flatMap[B](f: A => List[B]): List[B] =
    this match {
      case List =>
        Nil
      case Cons(a, tail) =>
        concatenate(f(a), (tail flatMap f))
    }
}

case object Nil extends List[Nothing]
case class Cons[+A](head: A, tail: List[A]) extends List[A]

object List {
  def concatenate[A](left: List[A], right: List[A]): List[A] =
    left match {
      case Nil =>
        right
      case Cons(head, tail) =>
        Cons(head, concatenate(tail, right))
    }
}

```

```

// sample Kleisli arrows
val twoCharsFrom: Char => List[Char] =
  c => Cons(c, Cons((c+1).toChar, Nil))

val twoIntsFrom: Char => List[Int] =
  c => Cons(c, Cons(c+1, Nil))

val twoBoolsFrom: Int => List[Boolean] =
  n => Cons(n % 2 == 0, Cons(n % 2 == 1, Nil))

assert(twoCharsFrom('A') == Cons('A', Cons('B', Nil)))
assert(twoIntsFrom('A') == Cons(65, Cons(66, Nil)))
assert(twoBoolsFrom(66) == Cons(true, Cons(false, Nil)))

```

```

// composing the arrows using a for comprehension
val result: List[String] =
  for {
    char <- twoCharsFrom('A')
    int   <- twoIntsFrom(char)
    bool  <- twoBoolsFrom(int)
  } yield s"$char-$int-$bool"

assert(result ==
  Cons("A-65-false", Cons("A-65-true",
    Cons("A-66-true", Cons("A-66-false",
      Cons("B-66-true", Cons("B-66-false",
        Cons("B-67-false", Cons("B-67-true", Nil
)))))))) )

```

```
// The Reader Monad
case class Reader[E,A](run: E => A) {

  def map[B](f: A => B): Reader[E,B] =
    this flatMap { a => Reader( e => f(a) ) }

  def flatMap[B](f: A => Reader[E,B]): Reader[E,B] =
    Reader { e =>
      val a = run(e)
      f(a).run(e)
    }
}
```

```
// composing the arrows using a for comprehension
val result: Reader[Config, String] =
  for {
    pathAndParams <- addPath("docid?123")
    urlWithoutProtocol <- addHost(pathAndParams)
    url <- addProtocol(searchUrlWithoutProtocol)
  } yield url

assert(
  result.run(config)
==
  "http://video.google.co.uk:80/videoplay?docid?123"
)
```



On the left is the **Reader monad**, and in the next slide, we look at the **Writer monad**

```
type Config = Map[String, String]
val config = Map( "searchPath" -> "videoplay",
                  "hostName"   -> "video.google.co.uk",
                  "port"        -> "80",
                  "protocol"   -> "http" )

// sample Kleisli arrows
val addPath: String => Reader[Config, String] =
  (parameters: String) =>
    Reader(config =>
      s"${config("searchPath")}?${parameters}")

val addHost: String => Reader[Config, String] =
  (pathAndParams: String) =>
    Reader(cfg =>
      s"${cfg("hostName")}:${cfg("port")}/$pathAndParams")

val addProtocol: String => Reader[Config, String] =
  (hostWithPathAndParams: String) =>
    Reader(config =>
      s"${config("protocol")}://${hostWithPathAndParams}")
```

```
// The Writer Monad
case class Writer[A](value: A, log: List[String]) {
    def map[B](f: A => B): Writer[B] = {
        this flatMap { a => Writer(f(a), List()) }
    }

    def flatMap[B](f: A => Writer[B]): Writer[B] = {
        val nextValue: Writer[B] = f(value)
        Writer(nextValue.value, this.log ::: nextValue.log)
    }
}
```

```
// sample Kleisli arrows
def increment(n: Int): Writer[Int] =
    Writer(n + 1, List(s"increment $n"))

def isEven(n: Int): Writer[Boolean] =
    Writer(n % 2 == 0, List(s"isEven $n"))

def negate(b: Boolean): Writer[Boolean] =
    Writer(!b, List(s"negate $b"))

assert(increment(3)==Writer(4,List("increment 3")))
assert(isEven(4)==Writer(true,List("isEven 4")))
assert(negate(true)==Writer(false,List("negate true")))
```

```
// composing the arrows using a for comprehension
val result: Writer[Boolean] =
    for {
        four      <- increment(3)
        isEven   <- isEven(four)
        negation <- negate(isEven)
    } yield negation

val Writer(flag, log) = result
assert( ! flag )
assert( log == List("increment 3",
                     "isEven 4",
                     "negate true") )
```



On the next slide, our final example: the **State monad**

 @philip\_schwarz

```
// The State Monad
case class State[S,A](run: S => (S,A)) {

  def map[B](f: A => B): State[S,B] =
    this flatMap { a => State { s => (s, f(a)) } }

  def flatMap[B](f: A => State[S,B]): State[S,B] =
    State { s =>
      val (s1, a) = run(s)
      f(a).run(s1)
    }
}
```

```
// composing the arrows using a for comprehension
val result: State[Stack, Int] =
  for {
    topItem      <- pop()
    itemCount    <- pushAndCount(topItem)
    bottomElement <- peekNth(itemCount)
  } yield bottomElement

val stack = List(10,20,30)
val (_, bottomElement) = result.run(stack)
assert( bottomElement == 10 )
```



The **Kleisli arrows** on this slide are very contrived because I am doggedly sticking to the self-imposed constraint that each arrow should take as input the output of the previous arrow.

See the next slide for a more sensible Stack API and an example of its usage.

```
type Stack = List[Int]
val empty: Stack = Nil

// sample Kleisli arrows
val pop: () => State[Stack, Int] = () =>
  State { stack =>
    (stack.tail, stack.head)
  }

val pushAndCount: Int => State[Stack, Int] = n =>
  State { stack =>
    (n :: stack, stack.length + 1)
  }

val peekNth: Int => State[Stack, Int] = n =>
  State { stack =>
    (stack, stack(stack.length - n))
  }
```

```
type Stack = List[Int]
val empty: Stack = Nil

// a saner, less contrived Stack API
val pop: State[Stack, Int] =
  State { stack =>
    (stack.tail, stack.head)
  }

val push: Int => State[Stack, Unit] = n =>
  State { stack =>
    (n :: stack, ())
  }

val peek: State[Stack, Int] =
  State { stack =>
    (stack, stack.last)
  }
```

```
val result: State[Stack, Int] =
  for {
    _ <- push(10)
    _ <- push(20)
    a <- pop
    b <- pop
    _ <- push(a + b)
    c <- peek
  } yield c

val (_, topElement) = result.run(empty)

assert( topElement == 30 )
```



See the following slide deck for the list of all available decks in the **MONAD FACT** series

# The **MONAD FACT** Slide Deck Series

a very simple rationale for the series  
plus a list of currently available slide decks

$$\begin{array}{ccc} T^3 & \xrightarrow{T\mu} & T^2 \\ \downarrow \mu T & \text{FACT} & \downarrow \mu \\ T^2 & \xrightarrow{\mu} & T \end{array}$$

slides by @philip\_schwarz

slideshare <https://www.slideshare.net/pjschwarz>